

---

# **ROBUST CONTROL**

## **The Parametric Approach**

---

**S. P. Bhattacharyya**  
Texas A&M University

**H. Chapellat**  
Schlumberger Corporation

**L. H. Keel**  
Tennessee State University

*THIS BOOK IS DEDICATED TO*

*Krishna Lee, Mohadev and Shona Lee*

S.P. Bhattacharyya

*My beloved family: Pierre, Jacqueline, Laetitia, Patrick,  
Véronique et Pascale*

H. Chapellat

*Sook, Allen and Jessica*

L.H. Keel

---

---

# Contents

<b>FOREWORD</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>PREFACE</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>0 BACKGROUND AND MOTIVATION</b>	<b>1</b>
0.1 INTRODUCTION TO CONTROL	1
0.1.1 Regulators and Servomechanisms	3
0.1.2 Performance: Tracking and Disturbance Rejection	3
0.1.3 Quantitative feedback theory	6
0.1.4 Perfect Steady State Tracking	7
0.1.5 The Characteristic Polynomial and Nyquist Criterion	8
0.1.6 Uncertainty Models and Robustness	10
0.1.7 $H_\infty$ Optimal Control	14
0.1.8 $\mu$ Theory	16
0.2 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND	17
0.3 THE PARAMETRIC THEORY	24
0.4 DISCUSSION OF CONTENTS	26
0.5 NOTES AND REFERENCES	29
<b>1 STABILITY THEORY VIA THE BOUNDARY CROSSING THEOREM</b>	<b>30</b>
1.1 INTRODUCTION	30
1.2 THE BOUNDARY CROSSING THEOREM	31
1.2.1 Zero Exclusion Principle	38
1.3 THE HERMITE-BIEHLER THEOREM	38
1.3.1 Hurwitz Stability	39
1.3.2 Hurwitz Stability for Complex Polynomials	46
	<b>i</b>

---

1.3.3	The Hermite-Biehler Theorem: Schur Case	48
1.4	SCHUR STABILITY TEST	54
1.5	HURWITZ STABILITY TEST	58
1.6	A FEW COMPLEMENTS	62
1.7	EXERCISES	67
1.8	NOTES AND REFERENCES	69
<b>2</b>	<b>STABILITY OF A LINE SEGMENT</b>	<b>71</b>
2.1	INTRODUCTION	71
2.2	BOUNDED PHASE CONDITIONS	72
2.3	SEGMENT LEMMA	79
2.3.1	Hurwitz Case	79
2.3.2	Schur Case	82
2.4	SOME FUNDAMENTAL PHASE RELATIONS	91
2.4.1	Phase Properties of Hurwitz Polynomials	91
2.4.2	Phase Relations for a Segment	99
2.5	CONVEX DIRECTIONS	102
2.6	THE VERTEX LEMMA	112
2.7	EXERCISES	116
2.8	NOTES AND REFERENCES	120
<b>3</b>	<b>THE STABILITY BALL IN COEFFICIENT SPACE</b>	<b>121</b>
3.1	INTRODUCTION	121
3.2	THE BALL OF STABLE POLYNOMIALS	122
3.3	THE REAL $\ell_2$ STABILITY BALL	124
3.3.1	Hurwitz Stability	124
3.3.2	Schur Stability	132
3.4	THE TSYPKIN-POLYAK LOCUS: $\ell_p$ STABILITY BALL	139
3.5	ROBUST STABILITY OF DISC POLYNOMIALS	148
3.5.1	Hurwitz Case	150
3.5.2	Schur Case	153
3.5.3	Some Extensions	155
3.6	EXERCISES	158
3.7	NOTES AND REFERENCES	163
<b>4</b>	<b>THE PARAMETRIC STABILITY MARGIN</b>	<b>164</b>
4.1	INTRODUCTION	164
4.2	THE STABILITY BALL IN PARAMETER SPACE	168

4.3	THE IMAGE SET APPROACH	170
4.4	STABILITY MARGIN COMPUTATION IN THE LINEAR CASE	171
4.5	$l_2$ STABILITY MARGIN	174
	4.5.1 Discontinuity of the Stability Margin	179
	4.5.2 $l_2$ Stability Margin for Time-delay Systems	179
4.6	$l_\infty$ AND $l_1$ STABILITY MARGINS	183
4.7	POLYTOPIC FAMILIES	183
	4.7.1 Exposed Edges and Vertices	184
	4.7.2 Bounded Phase Conditions for Checking Robust Stability of Polytopes	187
	4.7.3 Polytopes of Complex Polynomials	199
	4.7.4 Polytopes of Quasipolynomials	201
4.8	EXTREMAL PROPERTIES OF EDGES AND VERTICES	205
4.9	THE TSYPKIN-POLYAK PLOT	207
4.10	ROBUST STABILITY OF LINEAR DISC POLYNOMIALS	217
4.11	EXERCISES	218
4.12	NOTES AND REFERENCES	222
<b>5</b>	<b>INTERVAL POLYNOMIALS: KHARITONOV'S THEOREM</b>	<b>223</b>
5.1	INTRODUCTION	223
5.2	KHARITONOV'S THEOREM FOR REAL POLYNOMIALS	224
5.3	KHARITONOV'S THEOREM FOR COMPLEX POLYNOMIALS	232
5.4	INTERLACING AND IMAGE SET INTERPRETATION	235
	5.4.1 Two Parameter Representation of Interval Polynomials	238
	5.4.2 Image Set Based Proof of Kharitonov's Theorem	239
	5.4.3 Image Set Edge Generators and Exposed Edges	241
5.5	EXTREMAL PROPERTIES OF THE KHARITONOV POLYNOMIALS	241
	5.5.1 Extremal Parametric Stability Margin Property	241
	5.5.2 Extremal Gain Margin for Interval Systems	245
5.6	ROBUST STATE-FEEDBACK STABILIZATION	247
5.7	POLYNOMIAL FUNCTIONS OF INTERVAL POLYNOMIALS	253
5.8	SCHUR STABILITY OF INTERVAL POLYNOMIALS	256
5.9	EXERCISES	263
5.10	NOTES AND REFERENCES	267
<b>6</b>	<b>THE EDGE THEOREM</b>	<b>269</b>
6.1	INTRODUCTION	269

---

6.2	THE EDGE THEOREM	270
6.3	EXAMPLES	278
6.4	EXTENSIONS OF EDGE RESULTS	285
	6.4.1 Maximizing the Uncertainty Set	287
6.5	EXERCISES	289
6.6	NOTES AND REFERENCES	291
<b>7</b>	<b>THE GENERALIZED KHARITONOV THEOREM</b>	<b>293</b>
7.1	INTRODUCTION	293
7.2	PROBLEM FORMULATION AND NOTATION	295
7.3	THE GENERALIZED KHARITONOV THEOREM	300
7.4	EXAMPLES	310
7.5	IMAGE SET INTERPRETATION	316
7.6	EXTENSION TO COMPLEX QUASIPOLYNOMIALS	318
7.7	$\sigma$ AND $\theta$ HURWITZ STABILITY OF INTERVAL POLYNOMIALS	322
7.8	EXERCISES	326
7.9	NOTES AND REFERENCES	329
<b>8</b>	<b>FREQUENCY DOMAIN PROPERTIES OF LINEAR INTERVAL SYSTEMS</b>	<b>331</b>
8.1	INTRODUCTION	331
8.2	INTERVAL CONTROL SYSTEMS	332
8.3	FREQUENCY DOMAIN PROPERTIES	334
8.4	NYQUIST, BODE, AND NICHOLS ENVELOPES	343
8.5	EXTREMAL STABILITY MARGINS	353
	8.5.1 Guaranteed Gain and Phase Margins	354
	8.5.2 Worst Case Parametric Stability Margin	354
8.6	LINEAR INTERVAL CONTROL SYSTEMS	357
8.7	POLYTOPIC SYSTEMS	362
8.8	LINEAR FRACTIONAL TRANSFORMATION	363
8.9	ROBUST PARAMETRIC CLASSICAL DESIGN	366
	8.9.1 Guaranteed Classical Design	366
	8.9.2 Optimal Controller Parameter Selection	376
	8.9.3 Discrete Time Control Systems	379
8.10	EXERCISES	383
8.11	NOTES AND REFERENCES	385

<b>9 ROBUST STABILITY AND PERFORMANCE UNDER MIXED PERTURBATIONS</b>	<b>386</b>
9.1 INTRODUCTION	386
9.2 SMALL GAIN THEOREM	387
9.3 SMALL GAIN THEOREM FOR INTERVAL SYSTEMS	388
9.3.1 Worst Case $H_\infty$ Stability Margin	393
9.3.2 Worst Case Parametric Stability Margin	394
9.4 ROBUST SMALL GAIN THEOREM	397
9.5 ROBUST PERFORMANCE	401
9.6 VERTEX RESULTS FOR EXTREMAL $H_\infty$ NORMS	403
9.7 THE ABSOLUTE STABILITY PROBLEM	406
9.8 CHARACTERIZATION OF THE SPR PROPERTY	412
9.8.1 SPR Conditions for Interval Systems	414
9.9 THE ROBUST ABSOLUTE STABILITY PROBLEM	421
9.10 EXERCISES	428
9.11 NOTES AND REFERENCES	431
<b>10 MULTILINEAR INTERVAL SYSTEMS: THE MAPPING THEOREM</b>	<b>432</b>
10.1 INTRODUCTION	432
10.2 THE MAPPING THEOREM	434
10.3 ROBUST STABILITY VIA THE MAPPING THEOREM	438
10.3.1 Refinement of the Convex Hull Approximation	440
10.4 MULTILINEAR INTERVAL SYSTEMS	442
10.5 EXAMPLES	446
10.5.1 Parametric Stability Margin	446
10.5.2 Robust Gain, Phase, Time-delay and $H_\infty$ Stability Margins	447
10.6 EXERCISES	455
10.7 NOTES AND REFERENCES	459
<b>11 FREQUENCY DOMAIN PROPERTIES OF MULTILINEAR INTERVAL SYSTEMS</b>	<b>460</b>
11.1 INTRODUCTION	460
11.2 MULTILINEAR INTERVAL POLYNOMIALS	462
11.2.1 Dependencies Between the Perturbations	465
11.3 PARAMETRIC STABILITY MARGIN	471
11.4 MULTILINEAR INTERVAL SYSTEMS	473
11.4.1 Extensions of Boundary Results	477

11.5	$H_\infty$ STABILITY MARGIN	483
11.6	NONLINEAR SECTOR BOUNDED STABILITY MARGIN	486
11.7	INTERVAL PLANTS AND DIAGONAL REPRESENTATION	489
	11.7.1 Diagonal Feedback Representation of an Interval System	490
	11.7.2 Interval Plant with $H_\infty$ Norm-Bounded Uncertainty	494
	11.7.3 Multiple Interval Systems and Unstructured Blocks	496
	11.7.4 Extremal Properties	501
11.8	EXERCISES	503
11.9	NOTES AND REFERENCES	506
<b>12</b>	<b>STATE SPACE PARAMETER PERTURBATIONS</b>	<b>508</b>
12.1	INTRODUCTION	508
12.2	STATE SPACE PERTURBATIONS	509
12.3	ROBUST STABILITY OF INTERVAL MATRICES	510
	12.3.1 Unity Rank Perturbation Structure	510
	12.3.2 Interval Matrix Stability via the Mapping Theorem	511
	12.3.3 Numerical Examples	512
12.4	ROBUSTNESS USING A LYAPUNOV APPROACH	518
	12.4.1 Robustification Procedure	521
12.5	THE MATRIX STABILITY RADIUS PROBLEM	525
	12.5.1 The Complex Matrix Stability Radius	527
	12.5.2 The Real Matrix Stability Radius	528
	12.5.3 Example	528
12.6	TWO SPECIAL CLASSES OF INTERVAL MATRICES	529
	12.6.1 Robust Schur Stability of Nonnegative Matrices	529
	12.6.2 Robust Hurwitz Stability of Metzlerian Matrices	530
	12.6.3 Real Stability Radius	531
	12.6.4 Robust Stabilization	532
12.7	EXERCISES	534
12.8	NOTES AND REFERENCES	536
<b>13</b>	<b>ROBUST PARAMETRIC STABILIZATION</b>	<b>538</b>
13.1	INTRODUCTION	538
13.2	SIMULTANEOUS STRONG STABILIZATION	539
13.3	INTERNAL STABILITY AND THE Q PARAMETERIZATION	545
13.4	ROBUST STABILIZATION: UNSTRUCTURED PERTURBATIONS	547
13.5	NEVANLINNA-PICK INTERPOLATION	550



---

13.6	OVERBOUNDING PARAMETRIC UNCERTAINTY	552
13.7	ROBUST STABILIZATION: STATE SPACE SOLUTION	567
13.8	A ROBUST STABILITY BOUND FOR INTERVAL SYSTEMS	573
13.9	EXERCISES	579
13.10	NOTES AND REFERENCES	581
<b>14</b>	<b>INTERVAL MODELLING, IDENTIFICATION AND CONTROL</b>	<b>582</b>
14.1	INTRODUCTION	582
14.2	INTERVAL MODELING WITH A SINGLE DATA SET	583
14.2.1	Interval System Modeling	585
14.2.2	Nominal System Identification	585
14.2.3	Weight Selection	586
14.2.4	Interval System Identification	587
14.3	APPLICATION TO A MINI-MAST SYSTEM	589
14.3.1	Model Description	589
14.3.2	Interval Model Identification	589
14.3.3	Model Validation	593
14.4	VIBRATION SUPPRESSION CONTROL OF A STRUCTURE	593
14.4.1	Model Identification	603
14.4.2	Experimental Results	607
14.5	NOTES AND REFERENCES	614
	<b>References</b>	<b>616</b>
	<b>Author Index</b>	<b>637</b>
	<b>Subject Index</b>	<b>641</b>



---

---

# FOREWORD

Control systems need to be designed so that certain essential properties remain unchanged under perturbations. The design problem of maintaining invariance of system properties under small perturbations of the system parameters were considered in the initial stages of the development of Control Theory. These properties included the stability and performance of systems. It was understood later that even more important was the requirement that a control system function satisfactorily under large perturbations. Thus the problems of stability and performance validation for a family of controlled systems with parameters or frequency responses lying within admissible sets, have attracted considerable attention. This field has come to be known as Robust Control.

The theory of Robust Control has been elegantly developed within the  $H_\infty$  framework. This framework can effectively deal with robust stability and performance problems under unstructured perturbations. It is however quite deficient in addressing the same issues when parameter uncertainty is considered.

The treatment of robust stability problems under parameter uncertainty has been pioneered by the Italian mathematician Faedo (1953) and the Russian scientist Kharitonov (1978). A rich array of useful results have been developed over the last ten years and at present there exists an extensive literature in this specific field.

The authors of the present book are well known as experts in the area of Robust Control under parameter uncertainty. They have actively participated in the development of the theory, and their personal contribution cannot be overestimated. It suffices to mention their developments of the Generalized Kharitonov Theorem, the theory of disk polynomials, the extremal properties of interval systems, the calculation of the real parametric stability margin and their contributions to design problems under simultaneous parametric and nonparametric uncertainty, among others.

The book contains a complete account of most of the fundamental results in this field. The proofs of the results are elegant, simple and insightful. At the same time careful attention is paid to basic aspects of control problems such as design, performance, and synthesis and their relationship to the theory developed. The organization and sequence of the material has many significant merits and the

entire book is written with great expertise, style, rigour and clarity.

The reader will find here a unified approach to robust stability theory. It includes both linear and nonlinear systems. A systematic use of frequency domain methods allowed the authors to combine different types of uncertainty and to link parametric robust stability with nonlinear perturbations and the results of  $H_\infty$  theory. Numerous examples of various origins, as well as exercises are included. It will be helpful to a broad audience of control theorists and students, and indispensable to the specialist in Robust Control.

The book should stand as an outstanding and fundamental contribution to the science of automatic control and I commend the authors for their effort. I felt a true pleasure when reading this book, and I believe the reader will share my feelings.

Ya. Z. Tsykin  
Institute of Control Science  
Moscow, Russia  
August 1994

---

---

# PREFACE

The subject of robust control began to receive worldwide attention in the late 1970's when it was found that Linear Quadratic Optimal Control ( $H_2$  optimal control), state feedback through observers, and other prevailing methods of control system synthesis such as Adaptive Control, lacked any guarantees of stability or performance under uncertainty. Thus, the issue of robustness, prominent in Classical Control, took rebirth in a modern setting.

$H_\infty$  optimal control was proposed as a first approach to the solution of the robustness problem. This elegant approach, and its offshoots, such as  $\mu$  theory, have been intensely developed over the past 12 years or so, and constitutes one of the triumphs of control theory. The theory provides a precise formulation and solution of the problem of synthesizing an output feedback compensator that minimizes the  $H_\infty$  norm of a prescribed system transfer function. Many robust stabilization and performance problems can be cast in this formulation and there now exists effective, and fairly complete theory for control system synthesis subjected to perturbations, in the  $H_\infty$  framework.

The  $H_2$  or  $H_\infty$  theory delivers an "optimal" feedback compensator for the system. Before such a compensator can be deployed in a physical (real-world) system it is natural to test its capabilities with regard to additional design criteria, not covered by the optimality criterion used. In particular the performance of any controller under real parameter uncertainty, as well as mixed parametric-unstructured uncertainty, is an issue which is vital to most control systems. However, optimal  $H_2$  or  $H_\infty$  theory is incapable of providing a direct and nonconservative answer to this important question.

The problem of robustness under parametric uncertainty received a shot in the arm in the form of Kharitonov's Theorem for interval polynomials, which appeared in the mid-1980's in the Western literature. It was originally published in 1978 in a Russian journal. With this surprising theorem the entire field of robust control under real parametric uncertainty came alive and it can be said that Kharitonov's Theorem is the most important occurrence in this area after the development of the Routh-Hurwitz criterion. A significant development following Kharitonov's Theorem was the calculation, in 1985, by Soh, Berger and Dabke of the radius of the

stability ball in the space of coefficients of a polynomial.

From the mid-1980's rapid and spectacular developments have taken place in this field. As a result we now have a rigorous, coherent, and comprehensive theory to deal directly and effectively with real parameter uncertainty in control systems. This theory nicely complements the optimal  $H_2$  and  $H_\infty$  theories as well as Classical Control and considerably extends the range of possibilities available to the control specialist.

The main accomplishment of this theory is that it allows us to determine if a linear time invariant control system, containing several uncertain real parameters remains stable as the parameters vary over a set. This question can be answered in a precise manner, that is, nonconservatively, when the parameters appear linearly or multilinearly in the characteristic polynomial. In developing the solution to the above problem, several important control system design problems are answered. These are 1) the calculation of the real parametric stability margin, 2) the determination of stability and stability margins under mixed parametric and unstructured (norm-bounded or nonlinear) uncertainty 3) the evaluation of the worst case or robust performance measured in the  $H_\infty$  norm, over a prescribed parametric uncertainty set and 4) the extension of classical design techniques involving Nyquist, Nichols and Bode plots and root-loci to systems containing several uncertain real parameters.

These results are made possible because the theory developed provides *built-in* solutions to several extremal problems. It identifies a priori the critical subset of the uncertain parameter set over which stability or performance will be lost and thereby reduces to a very small set, usually points or lines, the parameters over which robustness must be verified. This built-in optimality of the parametric theory is its main strong point particularly from the point of view of applications. It allows us, for the first time, to devise methods to effectively carry out robust stability and performance analysis of control systems under parametric and mixed uncertainty. To balance this rather strong claim we point out that a significant deficiency of control theory at the present time is the lack of nonconservative synthesis methods to achieve robustness under parameter uncertainty. Nevertheless, even here the sharp analysis results obtained in the parametric framework can be exploited in conjunction with synthesis techniques developed in the  $H_\infty$  framework to develop design techniques to partially cover this drawback.

The objective of this book is to describe the parametric theory in a self-contained manner. The book is suitable for use as a graduate textbook and also for self-study. The entire subject matter of the book is developed from the single fundamental fact that the roots of a polynomial depend continuously on its coefficients. This fact is the basis of the Boundary Crossing Theorem developed in Chapter 1 and is repeatedly used throughout the book. Surprisingly enough this simple idea, used systematically is sufficient to derive even the most mathematically sophisticated results. This economy and transparency of concepts is another strength of the parametric theory. It makes the results accessible and appealing to a wide audience and allows for a unified and systematic development of the subject. The contents

of the book can therefore be covered in one semester despite the size of the book. In accordance with our focus we do not develop any results in  $H_\infty$  or  $H_2$  theory although some results from  $H_\infty$  theory are used in the chapter on synthesis. In Chapter 0, which serves as an extension of this preface, we rapidly overview some basic aspects of control systems, uncertainty models and robustness issues. We also give a brief historical sketch of Control Theory, and then describe the contents of the rest of the chapters in some detail.

The theory developed in the book is presented in mathematical language. The results described in these theorems and lemmas however are completely oriented towards control systems applications and in fact lead to effective algorithms and graphical displays for design and analysis. We have throughout included examples to illustrate the theory and indeed the reader who wants to avoid reading the proofs can understand the significance and utility of the results by reading through the examples. A MATLAB based software package, the Robust Parametric Control ToolBox, has been developed by the authors in collaboration with Samir Ahmad, our graduate student. It implements most of the theory presented in the book. In fact, all the examples and figures in this book have been generated by this ToolBox. We gratefully acknowledge Samir's dedication and help in the preparation of the numerical examples given in the book. A demonstration diskette illustrating this package is included with this book.

S.P.B. would like to thank R. Kishan Baheti, Director of the Engineering Systems Program at the National Science Foundation, for supporting his research program. L.H.K. thanks Harry Frisch and Frank Bauer of NASA Goddard Space Flight Center and Jer-Nan Juang of NASA Langley Research Center for their support of his research, and Mike Busby, Director of the Center of Excellence in Information Systems at Tennessee State University for his encouragement.

It is a pleasure to express our gratitude to several colleagues and coworkers in this field. We thank Antonio Vicino, Alberto Tesi, Mario Milanese, Jo W. Howze, Aniruddha Datta, Mohammed Mansour, J. Boyd Pearson, Peter Dorato, Yakov Z. Tsypkin, Boris T. Polyak, Vladimir L. Kharitonov, Kris Hollot, Juergen Ackermann, Diedrich Hinrichsen, Tony Pritchard, Dragoslav D. Siljak, Charles A. Desoer, Soura Dasgupta, Suhada Jayasuriya, Rama K. Yedavalli, Bob R. Barmish, Mohammed Dahleh, and Biswa N. Datta for their, support, enthusiasm, ideas and friendship. In particular we thank Nirmal K. Bose, John A. Fleming and Bahram Shafai for thoroughly reviewing the manuscript and suggesting many improvements.

We are indeed honored that Academician Ya. Z. Tsypkin, one of the leading control theorists of the world, has written a Foreword to our book. Professor Tsypkin's pioneering contributions range from the stability analysis of time-delay systems in the 1940's, learning control systems in the 1960's to robust control under parameter uncertainty in the 1980's and 1990's. His observations on the contents of the book and this subject based on this wide perspective are of great value.

The first draft of this book was written in 1989. We have added new results of our own and others as we became aware of them. However, because of the rapid pace of developments of the subject and the sheer volume of literature that has been

published in the last few years, it is possible that we have inadvertently omitted some results and references worthy of inclusion. We apologize in advance to any authors or readers who feel that we have not given credit where it is due.

S. P. Bhattacharyya

H. Chapellat

L. H. Keel

December 5, 1994.